

# Enacting border security in the digital age

# How to (un)do borders with data

Security Flows Conference

19-20 September 2024

King's College London







## Aims of the Conference

'How to do things with words' and 'how to do words with things' have been key formulations of how social worlds are enacted and political realities brought into being. These articulations of performativity have also inspired critical research on borders, violence and (in)security in the digital age. The project 'Enacting border security in the digital age: Political worlds of data forms, flows and frictions' has focused on understanding the political, epistemic and ethical effects of enacting borders as data worlds. This conference invites participants to reflect not just on doing, making, enacting and performing borders with data, but also on undoing, unmaking, disrupting and counter-performing borders with data.

'How to (un)do borders with data' approaches the datafication of borders as an assemblage of technologies, people, (non)knowledge and power. An assemblage holds together and keeps apart, it enables proliferation and dispersal. Data borders are both new and old, continuous and discontinuous, digital and analogue, social and technical, working and not working, knowable and unknowable. How do we make sense of these seeming contradictions, frictions and tensions?

The conference aims to bring into conversation research that has focused on the details of how datafied borders work (or do not work) with research that has inquired into the critical possibilities of counter-data, counter-mapping, counter-archiving, counter-power or counter-performativity. The prefix 'counter' has a dual meaning: to oppose, to go against as well as to reckon, to compute. This dual etymology invites us to engage with the limits, obfuscations, obscurities, frictions, glitches, mess and non-knowledge produced at and through data borders. It also invites us to reckon with how data activism, data users and data rights are transformed by AI technologies and platform dynamics.

By drawing together theoretical, methodological and ethico-political perspectives on the datafication of border control, we aim to inquire into forms of collective knowledge, power and subjectivity and how these can be fostered and sustained.

## **Programme**

#### DAY 1 19 September 2024

9.00 - 9.30 | Arrival and coffee

#### 9.30 - 10.00 | Introduction and conference aims

Claudia Aradau - Borders, Data, Politics

# 10.00 - 11.30 | Panel 1 | Doing border security markets with data

Annalisa Pelizza - Border Control Between Free Market and Vendor Lock-Ins

Marielle Debos - The Biometric Promise: Technology, Market, and Elections in Africa

Anna Leander - Markets Making Migrants: Sim Cards, Secure Connections, and Commodified Subjectivities

Martin Lemberg-Pedersen - Market-crafting between private and public actors in the EU's border security sector

Chair: Tobias Blanke

## 11.30 - 13.00 | Panel 2 | (Un)Knowing borders with data

Nora Stel - The Agnopolitics of Refoulement - exploring the transnational politics of un/knowing refugee returns from Lebanon to Syria  $\,$ 

Sarah Perret - Violent Ends For Violent Devices? A Bourdieusian analysis of non-knowledge practices in border security design

Leonie Ansems de Vries - Entanglements of Uncertainty: The Affective Relationalities and Epistemic Politics of Migration

Margie Cheesman - Conjuring a Blockchain Pilot: Ignorance and Innovation in Humanitarian Aid

Chair: Emma Mc Cluskey

13.00 - 14.00 | Lunch

# 14.00 - 15.30 | Panel 3 | Datawork as borderwork: value and labour

Lucrezia Canzutti - Collecting, assembling, ordering: Border politics and the invisible data work of asylum

Enrica Rigo - Life-making across borders. A feminist view on mobility, value and social reproduction

Ruben Andersson - Building a 'good border' against extractive frontier economies

Lauren Martin - Cash Flows: Valuing Expertise in the Humanitarian Marketplace

Chair: Sarah Perret

## 15.30-16.00 | Coffee break

# 16.00-17.30 | Roundtable | Data borders: frictions, failures and beyond

Ibtehal Hussain, Antonella Napolitano, Sara Alsherif

Chair: Claudia Aradau

# Programme

## DAY 2 20 September 2024

9.30-10.00 | Arrival and coffee

# 10.00 - 11.30 | Panel 4 | Counter-data, counter-mapping, counter-archiving

Gavin Sullivan - Reassembling Infrastructural publics through security lists: material participation techniques for mapping list copatterning

Spyros-Vlad Oikonomou - Data for who, by who, and for what purpose?

Tobias Blanke - Reassembling digital archives—strategies for counter-archiving

Thais Lobo - Researching the Role of (Digital) Data in UK's Asylum Archive

Chair: Lucrezia Canzutti

11.30 - 13.00 | Roundtable | Undoing data borders: counter-performativity and counter-power

Themis Tzimas, Chiara Denaro, Chris Jones

Chair: Jef Huysmans

13.00-14.00 Lunch

#### Sara Alsherif

#### Open Rights Group

Sara is a human/ rights defender and researcher in digital rights with a master's degree in digital media from the University of Sussex. Her studies focus primarily on digital rights intersecting with human rights and gender studies. Her academic research has varied from critical analysis of how data is captured and disseminated in social media to the impact of women's representation in technology on code bias, machine learning and recognition technology, and their human rights implications.

In 2021, Sara launched a podcast in Arabic called Talk-Nology, which talks about technology, human rights and the effects of new technology on people's rights. She has been involved in several studies and work with UNESCO, New America Foundation, Media Diversity Institute, Association for Progressive Communication (APC), Global voices, and in Egypt with Massar for technology and Law and Motoon. Sara is involved in many human rights and charitable local groups and movements in Brighton, like Amnesty and Thousand for thousand.

#### Ruben Andersson

#### University of Oxford

Ruben Andersson is Professor of Social Anthropology at the Department of International Development, University of Oxford. His research has focused on migration, borders and security, with specific reference to the Sahel and southern Europe. He is the author of *Illegality, Inc.: Clandestine migration and the business of bordering Europe* (California 2014), *No Go World: How fear is redrawing our maps and infecting our politics* (California 2019) and, together with David Keen, *Wreckonomics: Why it's time to end the war on everything* (Oxford 2023). He is currently PI on a Leverhulme Major Research Grant entitled 'Apocalypse Soon: Security, subversion and the struggle for a human future', which will result in a book on the politics of global security for the trade imprint William Collins.

#### Leonie Ansems de Vries

#### King's College London

Leonie Ansems de Vries is a Reader in International Politics at King's College London, Chair of the Migration Research Group and Director of the King's Sanctuary Programme. Her work combines research on migration, borders and the politics of violence with practical action and policy development on safe pathways. Her research brings together critical theoretical approaches with extensive empirical research using collaborative and arts-based methodologies. Leonie has published widely on the governance of migration, migrants' struggles and border violence in academic journals and media platforms such as openDemocracy and The Conversation. She is the author of Re-Imagining a Politics of Life: From Governance of Order to Politics of Movement (Rowman and Littlefield International, 2014). Her forthcoming book, Politics of Exhaustion (Bristol University Press, 2025) examines the ways in which exhaustion is employed as a tool of governance to control people forced to (not-)move and how it is endured and resisted as a lived experience.

#### Claudia Aradau

#### King's College London

Claudia Aradau is Professor of International Politics in the Department of War Studies, King's College London. Her research has developed a critical political analysis of security practices. Her latest book, co-authored with Tobias is, Algorithmic Reason: The New Government of Self and Other (2022). She is currently working on a new book, provisionally entitled Politics of Disarticulation, which mobilises the concept of articulation work to understand border security and control through digital technologies. Claudia was an associate editor and editor of Security Dialogue (2008-2018), an editor of Radical Philosophy (2008-2023) and is now a co-editor of International Theory (2023-). She is currently Principal Investigator of the European Research Council Consolidator Grant 'Enacting border security in the digital age: Political worlds of data forms, flows and frictions' (2019-2025).

#### Tobias Blanke

#### University of Amsterdam

Tobias Blanke is Professor of Artificial Intelligence and Humanities at the University of Amsterdam and the Institute for Logic, Language, and Computation. He is also affiliated with King's College London as Professor of Social and Cultural Informatics. His academic background is in computer science and political philosophy. Blanke's principal research interests lie in artificial intelligence and big data devices for research, particularly in the human sciences. He has also published extensively on ethical questions of Artificial Intelligence such as predictive policing and algorithmic otherings, as well as critical digital practices, and the critique of digital platforms.

#### Lucrezia Canzutti

#### King's College London

Dr Lucrezia Canzutti is a Leverhulme Early Career Fellow in the Department of War Studies. Lucrezia's research interests include (digital) borders, migration, violence, and data and archival practices. She has worked in different geographical contexts in both the 'Global North' (Italy, Spain, the UK) and the 'Global South' (Cambodia). Her current research, titled 'Archives of Noncitizenship: Violence, Erasure and (Im)mobility in Cambodia', offers a novel conceptualisation of Noncitizenship as a project of racial exclusion and erasure that sits on a continuum of state violence. Foregrounding the temporal, material and spatial dimensions of Noncitizenship, Lucrezia's project asks how erasure can be evidenced and analysed, how it morphs over time, and how it is navigated and countered by those targeted by it. Prior to starting her Leverhulme, Lucrezia was a Research Associate on Prof. Claudia Aradau's project 'Security Flows'.

#### Margie Cheesman

#### King's College London

Dr Margie Cheesman is a Lecturer in Digital Economy at the Department of Digital Humanities. Margie's work examines digitalisation projects in humanitarian aid, asylum, and welfare. She uses ethnographic methods to engage with elite and marginalised groups, from aid organisations to asylum seekers and refugees. Her latest studies have investigated the social and political implications of web3 tech, including digital identity and currency experiments.

#### Marielle Debos

#### University of Paris Nanterre

Marielle Debos is Professor of Political Science at the University of Paris Nanterre and a member of the Institute for Social Sciences of Politics (CNRS). Her research is inscribed in the field of International Political Sociology. She has written about war, gender as well as biometrics and technologies.

After receiving her PhD in Political Science at Sciences Po in 2009, she was a Marie Skłodowska-Curie post-doctoral researcher at the University of California, Berkeley. In 2021, she was awarded a fellowship of the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton.

Her most recent research (supported by the Institut Universitaire de France) addresses the contemporary political and technological revolution in identity documentation and the invention of biometric voting in Africa. She studies the corporate interests as well as the diverse ideas, voices, and policies that have shaped this technological "solution" to the perceived failures of the state and elections on the continent. This research raises broader questions about the invention of markets, the social construction of technological promise and Africa's place in the global politics of surveillance. She is currently working on a book manuscript tentatively entitled The Biometric Promise: Technology, Market, and Elections in Africa.

#### Chiara Denaro

#### University of Bologna and ASGI

Chiara Denaro is a Postdoctoral researcher at Bologna University on the ERC Project HEMIG - "Hostile environments and the political ecology of border violence", part of ASGI (Associazione Studi Giuridici sull'Immigrazione) and the WatchTheMed Alarm Phone network. She is a social worker and sociologist (PhD) by training and, over the years, her socio-legal research has concerned asylum and migration policies in the Mediterranean space, border management, and externalization policies, human rights, the right to asylum, as well as the strategies of resistance and voice put in place by people on the move. Currently, she is researching the evolution of SAR policies over the last decades, and analyzing legal battlegrounds around Search and Rescue in the Central Mediterranean.

#### Rhiannon Emm

#### King's College London

Rhiannon is a fourth-year ESRC 1+3 funded PhD candidate in the Department of War Studies, researching the international politics of 'home'. Her research uses poststructural methods and theory to investigate the political content in discourses of 'home', with a specific focus on islands (Tuvalu, the Chagos Archipelago, and Hawai'i). She has further interests in international relations theory and philosophy of the social sciences more generally. She holds a BA in International Relations and an MA in International Conflict Studies, both also from the Department of War Studies. Rhiannon is also deputy editor for *Millennium: Journal of International Studies*, coordinator of the DoingIPS Seminar Series 24/25, and co-founder and -organiser of the Global Theory Forum working group (launching Sept 2024, LISS-DTP funded). She acted as Research Assistant for Prof. Claudia Aradau for the *How to (un)do borders with data* conference.

#### Ibtehal Hussain

#### University of Westminster

Ibtehal is a visiting lecturer at the University of Westminster, and a project coordinator at Unredacted, a research unit that investigates, documents, and makes accessible secretive UK state and corporate practices in the context of national security. Her previous work at Security Flows and GUARDINT involved researching data processes within bordering practices and contributing to work on intelligence scandals and the (non-)oversight of intelligence actors. Prior to that, Ibtehal's work focused on the arms trade and militarism, particularly in UK Higher Education. Her organising and research have revolved around a passion in the histories and trajectories of transnational resistance and solidarity.

#### Jef Huysmans

#### Queen Mary University of London

Jef Huysmans is Professor of International Politics in the School of Politics and International Relations at Queen Mary, University of London. He co-convenes the research cluster Doing International Political Sociology (<a href="http://www.doingips.org">http://www.doingips.org</a>).

He is best known for his work on the politics of insecurity, the securitization of migration, critical methods, and international political sociology. Currently he is working on an international political sociology of fracturing worlds and motioning the politics of (in)security.

He has published widely in leading journals in international studies, politics, and European studies. He is author of Security Unbound. Enacting Democratic Limits (Routledge, 2014), The Politics of Insecurity. Fear, Migration and Asylum in the EU. (Routledge 2006); and What is Politics? (Edinburgh University Press, 2005). He edited with Andrew Dobson and Raia Prokhovnik The Politics of Protection. Sites of Insecurity and Political Agency. (Routledge 2006); with Patricia Noxolo Community, citizenship, and the 'war on terror': Security and insecurity. (Palgrave 2009), with Xavier Guillaume Citizenship and Security. The Constitution of Political Being. (Routledge 2013), and with Claudia Aradau, Andrew Neal and Nadine Voelkner Critical Security Methods. New Frameworks for Analysis. (Routledge, 2014)

Website: http://www.politics.gmul.ac.uk/staff/profiles/huysmansjef.html

#### Chris Jones

#### Statewatch

Chris Jones is a journalist and researcher based in London. His work focuses on civil liberties, police powers and surveillance technologies. He works for the civil liberties monitoring organization Statewatch and has written for Politico Europe, EUobserver, OpenDemocracy and Público. Chris has been working for Statewatch since 2010 and in September 2020 was appointed as Executive Director. He specialises in issues relating to policing, migration, privacy and data protection and security technologies.

Email: chris@statewatch.org

@earsinfingers

#### Anna Leander

#### Geneva Graduate Institute

Anna Leander is Professor of International Relations at the Geneva Graduate Institute. She has previously held positions in Brazil, Denmark, Germany, Italy and the US. She has a longstanding interest in connecting sociological approaches and International Relations and in the commercialization of military and security matters. Her current research focusses on four interrelated themes: the commercial security politics of mundane material objects; of digital infrastructures; of aesthetics; and of expertise in International Relations. Anna is currently a principal investigator on the project The Future of Humanitarian Design. Her research recently appeared in journals such as Journal of European Public Policy, Global Studies Quarterly and Science, Technology & Human Values. Anna has contributed to the work and development of professional associations, publications and (journals and book series). She currently co-edits Voices in International Relations (Oxford University Press). She has also taken responsibility for evaluating and developing educational programs at all levels in her various home institutions. Finally, Anna has a longstanding engagement with professionals, activists and their associations in her areas of work.

#### Martin Lemberg-Pedersen

#### CIBO Barcelona and University of Warwick

Lemberg-Pedersen earned his Ph.D. in political philosophy from the University of Copenhagen. Since 2021, he has been Honorary Associate Professor at the Department of Politics and International Studies (PAIS), the University of Warwick, as well as an externally affiliated researcher with the Centre for the Study of International Affairs, Barcelona (CIDOB). Between 2021-2024 he was Head of Policy and Documentation for Amnesty International Denmark responsible for research on asylum policy, international humanitarian law, algorithmic discrimination, hate crimes, corporate due diligence, and arms exports. Until 2020, he was Associate Professor at the Centre for Advanced Migration Studies, University of Copenhagen and before that Assistant Professor at Global Refugee Studies, Aalborg University.

His academic research involves interdisciplinary analyses of Western asylum, border and deportation practices and infrastructures, including EU relations to forced migration in Greek, Turkish and Libyan contexts, and has also explored postcolonial trajectories, continuities and parallels between the transatlantic slave trade and Western displacement and migration control politics. His research has also focused on companies, public agencies and interest-based organizations in the political economy of the EU's military and border security sectors. Finally, through analyses of diplomatic relations and processes he has traced and followed processes of Western border externalization.

He has received grants from Horizon 2020, Independent Danish Research Fund, the Carlsberg Foundation and Puffendorf. His publications include articles in Forced Migration Review, Citizenship Studies, Political Geography, Journal of Borderlands Studies, Danish Foreign Policy Review and Energy Policy, and handbook and encyclopedia entries on Frontex, deportation, border control industries and externalization. Collaborations include the edited volume Postcolonality and Forced Migration: Mobility, Control, Agency (Bristol University Press, 2022), and a Special Issue in Migration and Society entitled Colonialism, Postcoloniality, and the Study of Forced Migration (2024).

#### Thais Lobo

#### King's College London

Thais Lobo holds an MA in Digital Humanities from King's College London. As a media researcher and practitioner, she combines data analysis and research outreach to disseminate critical insights into digital platforms and online cultures. She has applied digital methods to explore social issues such as disinformation, political bots, greenwashing, datafication and digital surveillance. She has contributed to EU-funded academic projects hosted at King's College London, collaborating with civil organisations such as the European Forest Institute, First Draft, and Global Witness. Her experience includes roles at media outlets in Brazil.

#### Lauren Martin

#### Durham University

Dr Lauren Martin is Associate Professor of Political Geography at Durham University. She has published research on the detention migrant and asylum-seeking families in the US, the securitisation of migration, and emerging economies of migration control in journals such as Annals of the American Association of Geographers; Progress in Human Geography; Political Geography; Territory, Politics, Governance; Environment & Planning A; and Geopolitics. Her recent projects include ESRC-funded "Digital Connectivity and Financial Inclusion in Refugee Governance" (GLiTCH, 2020-2024) and ISRF Political Economy Fellowship "Economies of Exclusion" (2020-2021). Her current work includes two collaborative projects. "Making Stockton a Home" is a participatory research project exploring refugee and migrant belonging in the post-industrial Teeside region. Working with Legal Centre Lesvos, "The Pushback Industry" documents financial relationships enabling pushback practices and human rights abuses in the Aegean Sea and will generate a public database and creative visualisation via a website.

#### Emma Mc Cluskey

#### University of Westminster

Emma Mc Cluskey is a Lecturer in Criminology at University of Westminster. Her research concerns the relationship between (in)security, mobility, surveillance and democracy from a transdisciplinary perspective, grounded in situated practice. Previous research has examined the dispersal of suspicion throughout society towards refugees and through the proliferation of border technologies. Of primary interest to Mc Cluskey is the role of surveillance technology in transformations of democratic culture and democratic imagination, particularly within the realm of the 'everyday' and spaces traditionally considered unimportant within global politics. Mc Cluskey is author of From Righteousness to Far Right: An Anthropological Rethinking of Critical Security Studies. She is also founding co-editor of a transdisciplinary journal; Political Anthropological Approaches in International Social Sciences (PARISS).

#### Antonella Napolitano

Antonella Napolitano is a researcher, writer and tech policy expert. Her work focuses on the impact of technology on society and human rights, particularly on migration, welfare and reproductive rights.

She currently works as an independent researcher and advisor with human rights organizations and public interest newsrooms. In 2023, she published the report "Artificial intelligence: the new frontier of the EU's border externalization strategy" for human rights NGO EuromedRights. In 2019, she co-authored "Digital Identity in the Migration and Refugee Context - Italy case study" with Data&Society, a US-based independent nonprofit research organization.

Previously, Antonella was Senior Policy Officer and Network Coordinator at Privacy International, where she developed a workstream on migration and surveillance technology and led the engagement of the organization's international network of partners. Before joining PI, she was Communications Manager at CILD, the Italian Coalition for Civil Liberties and Rights, where she co-founded the media outlet Open Migration, as well as leading the Civil Liberties in the Digital Age program. In the past, she was also Europe Editor of Personal Democracy Media, covering civic technology and political participation in Europe, and worked as Communications and Media consultant for the public and private sector.

She is a Forum Member at the European Philanthropic Initiative for Migration (EPIM), Europe's largest and longest-standing philanthropic collaborative working on issues of migration and inclusion.

#### Spyros-Vlad Oikonomou

#### Greek Refugee Council

Spyros-Vlad Oikonomou works as advocacy and communications officer at the Greek Council for Refugees (GCR) – a Civil Society Organisation (CSO) established in 1989, with a mandate to protect the rights of persons seeking and/or having been granted international protection. He has been part of GCR's team since 2017, with his core duties focusing on research and advocacy and more recently communications. Throughout the years, he has *inter alia* produced and contributed to a number of reports, studies and op-eds, including in collaboration with others CSOs and/or UN bodies, and has drafted and contributed to submissions before UN and EU human rights monitoring bodies, with the aim of highlighting deficiencies, challenges and violations with respect to the rights of refugees primarily in Greece.

He currently co-chairs the Greek National Protection Working Group, which operates under UNHCR in Greece, and is General Secretary of the Greek Art and Action Network – a grassroots organisation, which aims to promote fundamental rights through positive action in the fields of art, education and sports.

#### Annalisa Pelizza

#### University of Bologna and University of Aarhus

Annalisa Pelizza is full professor of science and technology studies (STS) at Aarhus University, department of Digital Design and Information Studies, and at the University of Bologna, department of Philosophy. She is vice president of STS Italia, member of the Editorial Board of Science, Technology & Human Values, member of the International Advisory Board of Tecnoscienza. Her research interests span governance of and by data infrastructures; long-term transformations in modern institutions often unnoticed and hidden in technical minutiae; sociotechnical aspects of data infrastructures, including ontologies and interoperability; social informatics and its methods. She is the author of over forty scientific articles and the monograph Communities at a Crossroads. Prof. Pelizza has been the recipient of excellence science grants, including two Marie Skłodowska-Curie Actions and the <u>Processing Citizenship</u> research project funded by the European Research Council.

#### Sarah Perret

#### Université Catholique de Lille

Dr Sarah Perret is Associate Professor of Political Science and International Relations at The European School of Political and Social Sciences (ESPOL) at the Lille Catholic University. She is also a research associate at King's College London and at the Chair of Geopolitics of Risk at the École Normale Supérieure in Paris where she is the principal collaborator on the ANR-PrAlrie project funded by the French Research National Agency entitled 'Artificial Intelligence at the Border'.

Her research focuses on the effects of security policies on issues of borders, identity, and mobility, through the collection and circulation of (non)knowledge, particularly with the exponential use of digital technologies such as biometrics and artificial intelligence. She also has conducted research on naturalisation legislations, securitization of immigration law-making, and on counterterrorism policies. Alongside her academic work, Sarah Perret has also been a Parliamentary Adviser to the French Assemblée Nationale, a Consultant at the World Bank, and a Ministerial Adviser for the French Government.

She is the author of Géopolitique du risque. De la possibilité du danger à l'incertitude de la menace (Geopolitics of risk. From the possibility of danger to the uncertainty of the threat) published in 2022 (Éditions du Cavalier Bleu) with J. P Burgess, as well as numerous articles in journals such as Review of International Studies, European Journal of International Security, Big Data & Society or Geopolitics.

#### Enrica Rigo

#### University of Rome III

Enrica Rigo is Associate Professor at University of Roma Tre where she teaches Philosophy of Law, Legal Philosophy in a Global Perspective and Law and Gender. Since 2010 Enrica Rigo is the coordinator of the Law Clinic on Migration and Citizenship that has gained recognition at national and international level for advocacy on the issues of migrants' rights, gender and asylum, gender based violence, intersectional discrimination and exploitation. In 2023 she co-founded FeministWhatch - trans-feminist observatory on gender-based violence and multiple discrimination. She is the author/editor of three books and numerous articles on migration, borders, asylum in gender perspective, intersectional theory and clinical legal education. Enrica is involved as an activist in the Italian and European movement in support of migrants' rights as well as in the feminist movement against gender based violence.

#### Nora Stel

#### Radboud University

Dr. Nora Stel is Assistant Professor at the Center for International Conflict Analysis and Management (CICAM) at the Political Science Department of Radboud University Nijmegen. Nora's work explores the epistemic politics of authority and legitimacy in conflict-affected settings, specifically focusing on the governance of forced displacement in the Middle East. Currently, she is working on the individual research project The Power of Inaction and Ambivalence in Transnational Refugee Governance funded by the Dutch Research Council's Talent Program. She is also a principal member of the project Tracing Syrian Refugee Return Dynamics across South/North Divides: The Interrelatedness of European Repatriation Decisions and Regional (Non-)Refoulement funded by the Swiss Network for International Studies and the Horizon Europe project GAPs – Decentering the Study of Migrant Returns and Readmission Policies in Europe and Beyond.

Nora has published over 20 peer-reviewed articles in journals including Security Dialogue, Political Geography, Development and Change and Antipode. Her monograph Refugee Governance in Lebanon: Hybrid Political Order and the Politics of Uncertainty was published with Routledge in 2020. Nora is a member of the editorial college of Migration Politics.

More information about her work and expertise can be found on: www.norastel.com.

#### Gavin Sullivan

#### University of Edinburgh

Dr. Gavin Sullivan is a Reader in International Human Rights Law at Edinburgh Law School and Principal Investigator of the UKRI Future Leaders Fellowship project, Infra-Legalities: Global Security Infrastructures, Artificial Intelligence and International Law. His current research examines how Al-driven security practices and automated decision-making is reshaping global counterterrorism law and governance, including the countering of terrorist and violent extremist content online and digital border governance. His first book, The Law of the List: UN Counterterrorism Sanctions and the Politics of Global Security Law (CUP, 2020), won the 2021 ISA International Law Book Award and 2021 STAIR-ISA Book Award for research bringing STS into dialogue with global politics. Gavin is also a practicing lawyer and has provided pro bono legal representation to people targeted by security lists worldwide since 2010, including before the UN Office of the Ombudsperson. He is a member of the International Advisory Committee of the Global Internet Forum to Counter Terrorism, Co-Director of the Scottish Council on Global Affairs, Senior Research Affiliate at the Edinburgh Futures Institute (EFI) Centre for Technomoral Futures, and member of the Editorial Board for the journal, Transnational Legal Theory. He has previously been a Visiting Fellow at the University Center for Human Values, Princeton University and a Visiting Scholar at UNSW Faculty of Law and Justice in Sydney, Australia.

#### Themis Tzimas

I hold a PhD in public international law and political science from the School of Law of Aristotle University of Thessaloniki. The theme of the thesis is human security within the framework of collective security. Following the completion of my PhD I have been working on issues of law and Artificial Intelligence. I have published several articles, one monograph and I am currently in the process of publishing the second one in this area. I am a member of the International Laboratory for the Black Sea and Eastern Mediterranean Studies, which is located at the school of Economics and Political Science of Aristotle University. Apart from public international law I have studied at the postgraduate level, public law, focusing on migrants' rights and political philosophy and I have conducted my MPhil on international terrorism. I teach at Panteion University of Athens, at the Hellenic Open University and at the Aristotle University of Thessaloniki. I teach at the MA on Mass Migration of the Aristotle University of Thessaloniki and I pioneered the initiative for the creation of a Center on Social Consultation for Al I have presented papers in international conferences and I have publications in international journals. I am a lawyer, focusing on human and refugee rights. I am also a columnist and politically active in Greece. I am currently working on issues related to Artificial Intelligence.

47SOUL - Border Ctrl. Ft. Shadia Mansour x Fedzilla (Official Video) السبعة و أربعين - طلبوا, ا 2020. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=iL11uPXsS4U.

Aizeki, Mizue, Matt Mahmoudi, and Coline Schupfer, eds. *Resisting Borders and Technologies of Violence*. Politics. Chicago, Illinois: Haymarket Books, 2023.

Amnesty International. 'Primer: Defending the Rights of Refugees and Migrants in the Digital Age'. London: Amnesty International, 2024. <a href="https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/pol40/7654/2024/en/">https://www.amnesty.org/en/documents/pol40/7654/2024/en/</a>.

Ansems de Vries, Leonie, Nora Stel, and Nadine Voelkner. 'Affect, Uncertainty and Exhaustion: Methodological Reflections on Migration Struggles and Governance'. In *Collective Movements and Emerging Political Spaces*, edited by Angharad Closs Stephens and Martina Tazzioli, 69–82. Taylor and Francis Inc., 2024. doi:10.4324/9781003264156-8.

Aradau, Claudia. 'Experimentality, Surplus Data and the Politics of Debilitation in Borderzones'. *Geopolitics* 27, no. 1 (1 January 2022): 26–46. doi:10.1080/14650045.2020.1853103.

Aradau, Claudia, and Sarah Perret. 'The Politics of (Non-)Knowledge at Europe's Borders: Errors, Fakes, and Subjectivity'. *Review of International Studies* 48, no. 3 (July 2022): 405–24. doi:10.1017/S0260210522000080.

Associazione per gli Studi Giuridici sull'Immigrazione. 'Associazione per Gli Studi Giuridici Sull'Immigrazione (ASGI\*)'. Accessed 2 September 2024. <a href="https://inlimine.asgi.it/categoria/english/">https://inlimine.asgi.it/categoria/english/</a>.

Blanke, Tobias. 'Reassembling Digital Archives—Strategies for Counter-Archiving'. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications* 11, no. 1 (2 February 2024): 1–12. doi:10.1057/s41599-024-02668-4.

Brankamp, Hanno. 'Camp Abolition: Ending Carceral Humanitarianism in Kenya (and Beyond)'. *Antipode* 54, no. 1 (2022): 106–29. doi:10.1111/anti.12762.

Canning, Victoria. 'Border (Mis)Management, Ignorance and Denial'. In *Ignorance, Power and Harm:* Agnotology and The Criminological Imagination, edited by Alana Barton and Howard Davis, 139–62. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2018. doi:10.1007/978-3-319-97343-2\_7.

Canzutti, Lucrezia. 'Paperwork, Data and Drudgery: The Invisible Work of Asylum Claims I Feature from King's College London'. Accessed 2 September 2024. <a href="https://www.kcl.ac.uk/paperwork-data-and-drudgery-the-invisible-work-of-asylum-claims">https://www.kcl.ac.uk/paperwork-data-and-drudgery-the-invisible-work-of-asylum-claims</a>.

Canzutti, Lucrezia, and Claudia Aradau. 'Collecting, Assembling, Ordering: Border Politics and the Invisible Data Work of Asylum'. *Environment and Planning C: Politics and Space*, 6 February 2024, 23996544241230189. doi:10.1177/23996544241230189.

Casalini, Francesca, and Javier López González. 'Trade and Cross-Border Data Flows'. OECD Trade Policy Papers. Vol. 220. OECD Trade Policy Papers, 23 January 2019. doi:10.1787/b2023a47-en.

Cobarrubias, Sebastian, Paolo Cuttitta, Maribel Casas-Cortés, Martin Lemberg-Pedersen, Nora El Qadim, Beste İşleyen, Shoshana Fine, Caterina Giusa, and Charles Heller. 'Interventions on the Concept of Externalisation in Migration and Border Studies'. *Political Geography* 105 (1 August 2023): 102911. doi:10.1016/j.polgeo.2023.102911.

Corderoy, Jenna. 'Transparency Under Threat: Monitoring FOI Compliance in the UK'. OpenDemocracy, June 2024. <a href="https://cdn2.opendemocracy.net/media/documents/">https://cdn2.opendemocracy.net/media/documents/</a> FOI\_report\_final\_IntSAHP.pdf.

Davies, Thom, Arshad Isakjee, and Jelena Obradovic-Wochnik. 'Epistemic Borderwork: Violent Pushbacks, Refugees, and the Politics of Knowledge at the EU Border'. *Annals of the American Association of Geographers* 113, no. 1 (2 January 2023): 169–88. doi:10.1080/24694452.2022.2077167.

Debos, Marielle. 'A Postcolonial Card Cartel: How European Companies Sold Biometric Voting in Africa'. Submitted to Development and Change, forthcoming.

———. 'Biometrics and the Disciplining of Democracy: Technology, Electoral Politics, and Liberal Interventionism in Chad'. *Democratization* 28, no. 8 (17 November 2021): 1406–22. doi:10.1080/13510347.2021.1907349.

Denaro, Chiara. 'La "Battaglia Legale" Nel Mediterraneo Centrale: Dal Reato Di Solidarietà Alla (de)Criminalizzazione Della Disobbedienza Civile'. *Rivista Studi Sulla Questione Criminale*, no. 1/2024 (2024): 79–104. doi:10.7383/112826.

——. 'The Sea As a Public Space: Claims for Justice in the Central Mediterranean'. *Quaderni Di Sociologia*, Forthcoming.

Denaro, Chiara, and Paolo Boccagni. 'Challenging Ungrievability for People Missing at Sea. Search Infrastructures, Spaces of Public Mourning, and Claims for Justice'. *Ethnic and Racial Studies* 46 (2023): 1–26. doi:10.1080/01419870.2023.2268172.

D'Ignazio, Catherine, and Lauren F. Klein. 'Feminist Data Visualization'. In Workshop on Visualization for the Digital Humanities (VIS4DH). Baltimore, 2016. <a href="https://www.kanarinka.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/IEEE\_Feminist\_Data\_Visualization.pdf">https://www.kanarinka.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/07/IEEE\_Feminist\_Data\_Visualization.pdf</a>.

Dini, Sabine Arkaida. 'Migrant Datafication as a "Cynegetic War"?: An Ethnography of International Organization for Migration Expansion in the Eastern African Republic of Djibouti'. *Political Anthropological Research on International Social Sciences (PARISS)* 4, no. 1 (4 October 2023): 43–64. doi:10.1163/25903276-bja10044.

Fiddian-Qasmiyeh, Elena. 'Introduction: Recentering the South in Studies of Migration'. *Migration and Society* 3, no. 1 (1 June 2020): 1–18. doi:10.3167/arms.2020.030102.

Fortunati, Leopoldina. 'Law and the Reproduction Sphere as the Place of a Double Production of Value'. *Feminists@law* 12, no. 2 (11 December 2023). doi: 10.22024/UniKent/03/fal.1214.

Gilmore, Ruth Wilson. Abolition Geography: Essays Towards Liberation. London: Verso, 2023.

Giuffré, Mariagiulia, Chiara Denaro, and Fatma Raach. 'On "Safety" and EU Externalization of Borders:: Questioning the Role of Tunisia as a "Safe Country of Origin" and a "Safe Third Country". *European Journal of Migration and Law* 24, no. 4 (9 December 2022): 570–99. doi:10.1163/15718166-12340141.

Glouftsios, Georgios. 'Making Pushbacks Public: Secrecy, Material Witnesses and Devices of Dis/Appearance'. *Security Dialogue* 55, no. 1 (1 February 2024): 3–21. doi:10.1177/09670106231189389.

Greek Council for Refugees. 'Greece'. Asylum Information Database, 2024. <a href="https://asylumineurope.org/reports/country/greece/">https://asylumineurope.org/reports/country/greece/</a>.

———. 'Home - GCR', 21 June 2024. https://gcr.gr/en/.

Hinrichs, Uta, Stefania Forlini, and Bridget Moynihan. 'In Defense of Sandcastles: Research Thinking through Visualization in Digital Humanities'. *Digital Scholarship in the Humanities* 34, no. Supplement\_1 (1 December 2019): i80–99. doi:10.1093/llc/fqy051.

Huysmans, Jef, and João P. Nogueira. 'Against "Resistance"? Towards a Conception of Differential Politics in International Political Sociology'. *European Journal of International Relations* 30, no. 2 (1 June 2024): 359–81. doi:10.1177/13540661231185569.

Johns, Fleur. 'Digital Humanitarian Mapping and the Limits of Imagination in International Law'. *Law and Critique* 34, no. 3 (1 November 2023): 341–61. doi:10.1007/s10978-023-09361-6.

———. 'Global Governance through the Pairing of List and Algorithm'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 34, no. 1 (1 February 2016): 126–49. doi:10.1177/0263775815599307.

King, Russell, and Katie Kuschminder, eds. *Handbook of Return Migration*. Elgar Handbooks in Migration. Cheltenham, UK Northampton, MA, USA: Edward Elgar Publishing, 2022.

König, Magdalena. 'The Borders, They Are a-Changin'! The Emergence of Socio-Digital Borders in the EU'. *Internet Policy Review* 5, no. 1 (31 March 2016). doi:10.14763/2016.1.403.

Korkmaz, Emre Eren. Smart Borders, Digital Identity and Big Data: How Surveillance Technologies Are Used against Migrants. Bristol: Bristol University Press, 2024.

Lemberg-Pedersen, Martin, and Eman Haioty. 'Re-Assembling the Surveillable Refugee Body in the Era of Data-Craving'. *Citizenship Studies* 24, no. 5 (3 July 2020): 607–24. doi:10.1080/13621025.2020.1784641.

Lobo, Thais, and Claudia Aradau. 'The Burden of Data: Digital Tools, Evidence and Credibility in Asylum and Immigration Courts'. SECURITY FLOWS. London: King's College London, 2023. <a href="https://kclpure.kcl.ac.uk/ws/portalfiles/portal/266625720/">https://kclpure.kcl.ac.uk/ws/portalfiles/portal/266625720/</a> <a href="Lobo\_Aradau\_The\_burden\_of\_data\_report.pdf">Lobo\_Aradau\_The\_burden\_of\_data\_report.pdf</a>.

Madianou, Mirca. 'Technocolonialism: Digital Innovation and Data Practices in the Humanitarian Response to Refugee Crises'. *Social Media + Society* 5, no. 3 (1 April 2019): 2056305119863146. doi:10.1177/2056305119863146.

Marres, Noortje, and Javier Lezaun. 'Materials and Devices of the Public: An Introduction'. *Economy and Society* 40, no. 4 (1 November 2011): 489–509. doi:10.1080/03085147.2011.602293.

Martin, Lauren L, and Martina Tazzioli. 'Value Extraction through Refugee Carcerality: Data, Labour and Financialised Accommodation'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 41, no. 2 (1 April 2023): 191–209. doi:10.1177/02637758231157397.

Martin-Mazé, Médéric, and Sarah Perret. 'Designs of Borders: Security, Critique, and the Machines'. *European Journal of International Security* 6, no. 3 (August 2021): 278–300. doi:10.1017/eis.2021.8.

Mc Cluskey, Emma. 'Freedom, Technology and Surveillance: Everyday Paradoxes on the EU-Morocco Border'. *International Journal of Migration and Border Studies* 6, no. 1–2 (January 2020): 115–37. doi:10.1504/JJMBS.2020.108683.

Metcalfe, Philippa, and Lina Dencik. 'The Politics of Big Borders: Data (in)Justice and the Governance of Refugees'. *First Monday*, 1 April 2019. doi:10.5210/fm.v24i4.9934.

Mezzandro, Sandro, and Brett Neilson. 'Turning Production Over'. In *The Rest and the West*. London: Verso, 2024.

Miller, Todd. 'The Palestine Laboratory and the U.S.-Mexico Border: A Q&A with Antony Loewenstein', 23 February 2023. <a href="https://www.theborderchronicle.com/p/the-palestine-laboratory-and-the">https://www.theborderchronicle.com/p/the-palestine-laboratory-and-the</a>.

Morris, Julia C. 'Violence and Extraction of a Human Commodity: From Phosphate to Refugees in the Republic of Nauru'. *The Extractive Industries and Society* 6, no. 4 (1 November 2019): 1122–33. doi:10.1016/j.exis.2019.07.001.

———. Asylum and Extraction in the Republic of Nauru. Cornell University Press, 2023. <a href="https://www.cornellpress.cornell.edu/book/9781501765841/asylum-and-extraction-in-the-republic-of-nauru/">https://www.cornellpress.cornell.edu/book/9781501765841/asylum-and-extraction-in-the-republic-of-nauru/</a>.

Nassar, Jessy, and Nora Stel. 'Lebanon's Response to the Syrian Refugee Crisis – Institutional Ambiguity as a Governance Strategy'. *Political Geography* 70 (1 April 2019): 44–54. doi:10.1016/j.polgeo.2019.01.005.

Natter, Katharina, Kelsey Norman, and Nora Stel. 'Strategic Non-Regulation as Migration Governance'. *Migration Politics* 2, no. 1 (9 November 2023): 004. doi:10.21468/MigPol.2.1.004.

Pascucci, Elisa. 'More Logistics, Less Aid: Humanitarian-Business Partnerships and Sustainability in the Refugee Camp'. *World Development* 142 (1 June 2021): 105424. doi:10.1016/j.worlddev.2021.105424.

Pelizza, Annalisa. 'Identification as Translation: The Art of Choosing the Right Spokespersons at the Securitized Border'. *Social Studies of Science* 51, no. 4 (August 2021): 487–511. doi:10.1177/0306312720983932.

Pelizza, Annalisa, and Chiara Loschi. 'Telling "More Complex Stories" of European Integration: How a Sociotechnical Perspective Can Help Explain Administrative Continuity in the Common European Asylum System'. *Journal of European Public Policy* 31, no. 9 (September 2024): 2534–55. doi:10.1080/13501763.2023.2197945.

Pelizza, Annalisa, and Wouter Rudi Van Rossem. 'Scripts of Alterity: Mapping Assumptions and Limitations of the Border Security Apparatus through Classification Schemas'. *Science, Technology, & Human Values* 49, no. 4 (July 2024): 794–826. doi:10.1177/01622439231195955.

'Recording Mechanism of Incidents of Informal Forced Returns Annual Report 2022'. Hellenic Republic National Commission for Human Rights, 2022. <a href="https://nchr.gr/images/pdf/RecMechanism/Annual\_Report\_2022\_compressed\_1.pdf">https://nchr.gr/images/pdf/RecMechanism/Annual\_Report\_2022\_compressed\_1.pdf</a>.

Rigo, Enrica. 'Mobility, Social Reproduction and Exploitation: A Critical Legal Perspective on the Tension between Capitalism and Freedom of Movement'. *Feminists@law* 12, no. 2 (11 December 2023). doi:10.22024/UniKent/03/fal.1218.

Russell, Emma K, and Poppy de Souza. 'Counter-Mapping the Mobile Border: Racial Surveillance and Data Justice in Spaces of Disappearance'. *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 41, no. 3 (1 June 2023): 494–512. doi:10.1177/02637758231179224.

Scott-Smith, Tom. 'Modernism and Technology in Humanitarian Action'. In The Routledge International Handbook of Critical Philanthropy and Humanitarianism. Routledge, 2023.

Stein, Rebecca L., and Adi Kuntsman. 'Chapter 1: When Instagram Went to War'. In Digital Militarism: Israel's Occupation in the Social Media Age, 1–18. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2015.

Sullivan, Gavin. 'Law, Technology, and Data-Driven Security: Infra-Legalities as Method Assemblage'. *Journal of Law and Society* 49, no. S1 (2022): S31–50. doi:10.1111/jols.12352.

Tazzioli, Martina. 'Disjointed Knowledges, Obfuscated Visibility. Border Controls at the French-Italian Alpine Border'. *Political Geography* 79 (1 May 2020): 102155. doi:10.1016/j.polgeo.2020.102155.

———. 'Refugees' Debit Cards, Subjectivities, and Data Circuits: Financial-
Humanitarianism in the Greek Migration Laboratory'. International Political Sociology 13,
no. 4 (1 December 2019): 392–408. doi: <u>10.1093/ips/olz014</u> .

———. The Making of Migration: The Biopolitics of Mobility at Europe's Borders. London: Sage, 2019.

Villa-Nicholas, Melissa. Data Borders: How Silicon Valley Is Building an Industry around Immigrants. Oakland, California: University of California Press, 2023.

Walters, William. 'Migration, Vehicles, and Politics: Three Theses on Viapolitics'. *European Journal of Social Theory* 18, no. 4 (November 2015): 469–88. doi:10.1177/1368431014554859.